A BILL to amend and reenact §§ 2.2-3701, 2.2-3707, 2.2-3707.01, 2.2-3708.2, and 2.2-3714 of the Code of Virginia and to amend the Code of Virginia by adding a section numbered 2.2-3708.3, relating to meetings conducted by electronic communication means under the Virginia Freedom of Information Act.

Be it enacted by the General Assembly of Virginia:

1. That §§ 2.2-3701, 2.2-3707, 2.2-3707.01, 2.2-3708.2, and 2.2-3714 of the Code of Virginia are amended and reenacted and that the Code of Virginia is amended by adding a section numbered 2.2-3708.3 as follows:

§ 2.2-3701. Definitions.

As used in this chapter, unless the context requires a different meaning:

"All-virtual public meeting" means a public meeting (i) conducted by a public body using electronic communication means, (ii) during which all members of the public body who participate do so remotely rather than being assembled in one physical location, and (iii) to which public access is provided through electronic communications means.

"Closed meeting" means a meeting from which the public is excluded.

"Electronic communication" means the use of technology having electrical, digital, magnetic, wireless, optical, electromagnetic, or similar capabilities to transmit or receive information.

"Emergency" means an unforeseen circumstance rendering the notice required by this chapter impossible or impracticable and which circumstance requires immediate action.

"Hybrid public meeting" means a public meeting where (i) one or more members of the public body who participate do so remotely rather than being assembled in one physical location, (ii) at least a quorum of the members of the public body are assembled in one physical location, and (iii) public access is provided both in person at a physical location and through electronic communication means.
"Information" as used in the exclusions established by §§ 2.2-3705.1 through 2.2-3705.7, means the content within a public record that references a specifically identified subject matter, and shall not be interpreted to require the production of information that is not embodied in a public record.

"Meeting" or "meetings" means the meetings including work sessions, when sitting physically, or through electronic communication means pursuant to § 2.2-3708.2 or 2.2-3708.3, as a body or entity, or as an informal assemblage of (i) as many as three members or (ii) a quorum, if less than three, of the constituent membership, wherever held, with or without minutes being taken, whether or not votes are cast, of any public body. Neither the gathering of employees of a public body nor the gathering or attendance of two or more members of a public body (a) at any place or function where no part of the purpose of such gathering or attendance is the discussion or transaction of any public business, and such gathering or attendance was not called or prearranged with any purpose of discussing or transacting any business of the public body, or (b) at a public forum, candidate appearance, or debate, the purpose of which is to inform the electorate and not to transact public business or to hold discussions relating to the transaction of public business, even though the performance of the members individually or collectively in the conduct of public business may be a topic of discussion or debate at such public meeting, shall be deemed a "meeting" subject to the provisions of this chapter.

"Open meeting" or "public meeting" means a meeting at which the public may be present.

"Public body" means any legislative body, authority, board, bureau, commission, district, or agency of the Commonwealth or of any political subdivision of the Commonwealth, including counties, cities, and towns, planning commissions; governing boards of public institutions of higher education; and other organizations, corporations, or agencies in the Commonwealth supported wholly or principally by public funds. It shall include (i) the Virginia Birth-Related Neurological Injury Compensation Program and its board of directors established pursuant to Chapter 50 (§ 38.2-5000 et seq.) of Title 38.2 and (ii) any committee, subcommittee, or other entity however designated, of the public body created to perform delegated functions of the public body or to advise the public body. It shall not exclude any such
committee, subcommittee or entity because it has private sector or citizen members. Corporations organized by the Virginia Retirement System are "public bodies" for purposes of this chapter.

For the purposes of the provisions of this chapter applicable to access to public records, constitutional officers and private police departments as defined in § 9.1-101 shall be considered public bodies and, except as otherwise expressly provided by law, shall have the same obligations to disclose public records as other custodians of public records.

"Public records" means all writings and recordings that consist of letters, words, or numbers, or their equivalent, set down by handwriting, typewriting, printing, photostatting, photography, magnetic impulse, optical or magneto-optical form, mechanical or electronic recording or other form of data compilation, however stored, and regardless of physical form or characteristics, prepared or owned by, or in the possession of a public body or its officers, employees or agents in the transaction of public business.

"Regional public body" means a unit of government organized as provided by law within defined boundaries, as determined by the General Assembly, which unit includes two or more localities.

"Remote participation" means participation in a public meeting by an individual member of a public body using electronic communication means.

"Scholastic records" means those records containing information directly related to a student or an applicant for admission and maintained by a public body that is an educational agency or institution or by a person acting for such agency or institution.

"Trade secret" means the same as that term is defined in the Uniform Trade Secrets Act (§ 59.1-336 et seq.).

§ 2.2-3707. Meetings to be public; notice of meetings; recordings; minutes.
A. All meetings of public bodies shall be open, except as provided in §§ 2.2-3707.01 and 2.2-3711.
B. No meeting shall be conducted through telephonic, video, electronic, or other electronic communication means where the members are not physically assembled to discuss or transact public business, except as provided in §§ 2.2-3708.2 or 2.2-3708.3 as may be specifically provided in Title 54.1 for the summary suspension of professional licenses.
C. Every public body shall give notice of the date, time, and location of its meetings by:
1. Posting such notice on its official public government website, if any;
2. Placing such notice in a prominent public location at which notices are regularly posted; and
3. Placing such notice at the office of the clerk of the public body or, in the case of a public body that has no clerk, at the office of the chief administrator.

All state public bodies subject to the provisions of this chapter shall also post notice of their meetings on a central, publicly available electronic calendar maintained by the Commonwealth. Publication of meeting notices by electronic means by other public bodies shall be encouraged.

The notice shall be posted at least three working days prior to the meeting.

D. Notice, reasonable under the circumstance, of special, emergency, or continued meetings shall be given contemporaneously with the notice provided to the members of the public body conducting the meeting.

E. Any person may annually file a written request for notification with a public body. The request shall include the requester’s name, address, zip code, daytime telephone number, electronic mail address, if available, and organization, if any. The public body receiving such request shall provide notice of all meetings directly to each such person. Without objection by the person, the public body may provide electronic notice of all meetings in response to such requests.

F. At least one copy of the proposed agenda and all agenda packets and, unless exempt, all materials furnished to members of a public body for a meeting shall be made available for public inspection at the same time such documents are furnished to the members of the public body. The proposed agendas for meetings of state public bodies where at least one member has been appointed by the Governor shall state whether or not public comment will be received at the meeting and, if so, the approximate point during the meeting when public comment will be received.

G. Any person may photograph, film, record, or otherwise reproduce any portion of a meeting required to be open. The public body conducting the meeting may adopt rules governing the placement and use of equipment necessary for broadcasting, photographing, filming, or recording a meeting to prevent interference with the proceedings, but shall not prohibit or otherwise prevent any person from photographing, filming, recording, or otherwise reproducing any portion of a meeting required to be open.
No public body shall conduct a meeting required to be open in any building or facility where such recording devices are prohibited.

H. Minutes shall be recorded at all open meetings. However, minutes shall not be required to be taken at deliberations of (i) standing and other committees of the General Assembly; (ii) legislative interim study commissions and committees, including the Virginia Code Commission; (iii) study committees or commissions appointed by the Governor; or (iv) study commissions or study committees, or any other committees or subcommittees appointed by the governing bodies or school boards of counties, cities, and towns, except where the membership of any such commission, committee, or subcommittee includes a majority of the governing body of the county, city, or town or school board.

Minutes, including draft minutes, and all other records of open meetings, including audio or audio/visual records shall be deemed public records and subject to the provisions of this chapter.

Minutes shall be in writing and shall include (a) the date, time, and location of the meeting; (b) the members of the public body recorded as present and absent; and (c) a summary of the discussion on matters proposed, deliberated, or decided, and a record of any votes taken. In addition, for electronic communication meetings conducted in accordance with § 2.2-3707.01, minutes of state public bodies shall include (1) the identity of the members of the public body at each remote location identified in the notice who participated in the meeting through electronic communication means; (2) the identity of the members of the public body who were physically assembled at the primary or central meeting one physical location, if the meeting was a hybrid public meeting; and (3) the identity of the members of the public body who were not present at the locations identified in clauses (1) and (2) but who monitored such meeting through electronic communication means.

§ 2.2-3707.01. Meetings of the General Assembly.

A. Except as provided in subsection B, public access to any meeting of the General Assembly or a portion thereof shall be governed by rules established by the Joint Rules Committee and approved by a majority vote of each house at the next regular session of the General Assembly. At least 60 days before the adoption of such rules, the Joint Rules Committee shall (i) hold regional public hearings on such
proposed rules and (ii) provide a copy of such proposed rules to the Virginia Freedom of Information Advisory Council.

B. Floor sessions of either house of the General Assembly; meetings, including work sessions, of any standing or interim study committee of the General Assembly; meetings, including work sessions, of any subcommittee of such standing or interim study committee; and joint committees of conference of the General Assembly; or a quorum of any such committees or subcommittees, shall be open and governed by this chapter.

C. Meetings of the respective political party caucuses of either house of the General Assembly, including meetings conducted by telephonic or other electronic communication means, without regard to (i) whether the General Assembly is in or out of regular or special session or (ii) whether such caucuses invite staff or guests to participate in their deliberations, shall not be deemed meetings for the purposes of this chapter.

D. No regular, special, or reconvened session of the General Assembly held pursuant to Article IV, Section 6 of the Constitution of Virginia shall be conducted using electronic communication means pursuant to § 2.2-3708.2 or 2.2-3708.3.

§ 2.2-3708.2. Meetings held through electronic communication means during declared states of emergency.

A. The following provisions apply to all public bodies:

1. Subject to the requirements of subsection C, all public bodies may conduct any meeting wherein the public business is discussed or transacted through electronic communication means if, on or before the day of a meeting, a member of the public body holding the meeting notifies the chair of the public body that:

   a. Such member is unable to attend the meeting due to (i) a temporary or permanent disability or other medical condition that prevents the member's physical attendance or (ii) a family member's medical condition that requires the member to provide care for such family member, thereby preventing the member's physical attendance; or
b. Such member is unable to attend the meeting due to a personal matter and identifies with specificity the nature of the personal matter. Participation by a member pursuant to this subdivision b is limited each calendar year to two meetings or 25 percent of the meetings held per calendar year rounded up to the next whole number, whichever is greater.

2. If participation by a member through electronic communication means is approved pursuant to subdivision 1, the public body holding the meeting shall record in its minutes the remote location from which the member participated; however, the remote location need not be open to the public. If participation is approved pursuant to subdivision 1 a, the public body shall also include in its minutes the fact that the member participated through electronic communication means due to (i) a temporary or permanent disability or other medical condition that prevented the member’s physical attendance or (ii) a family member's medical condition that required the member to provide care for such family member, thereby preventing the member's physical attendance. If participation is approved pursuant to subdivision 1 b, the public body shall also include in its minutes the specific nature of the personal matter cited by the member.

If a member's participation from a remote location pursuant to subdivision 1 b is disapproved because such participation would violate the policy adopted pursuant to subsection C, such disapproval shall be recorded in the minutes with specificity.

3. Any public body, or any joint meetings thereof, may meet by electronic communication means without a quorum of the public body physically assembled at one location when the Governor has declared a state of emergency in accordance with § 44-146.17 or the locality in which the public body is located has declared a local state of emergency pursuant to § 44-146.21, provided that (i) the catastrophic nature of the declared emergency makes it impracticable or unsafe to assemble a quorum in a single location and (ii) the purpose of the meeting is to provide for the continuity of operations of the public body or the discharge of its lawful purposes, duties, and responsibilities. The public body convening a meeting in accordance with this subdivision section shall:
Give public notice using the best available method given the nature of the emergency, which notice shall be given contemporaneously with the notice provided to members of the public body conducting the meeting;

Make arrangements for public access to such meeting through electronic communication means, including videoconferencing if already used by the public body;

Provide the public with the opportunity to comment at those meetings of the public body when public comment is customarily received; and

Otherwise comply with the provisions of this chapter.

The nature of the emergency, the fact that the meeting was held by electronic communication means, and the type of electronic communication means by which the meeting was held shall be stated in the minutes.

The provisions of this subdivision shall be applicable only for the duration of the emergency declared pursuant to § 44-146.17 or 44-146.21.

The following provisions apply to regional public bodies:

1. Subject to the requirements in subsection C, regional public bodies may also conduct any meeting wherein the public business is discussed or transacted through electronic communication means if, on the day of a meeting, a member of a regional public body notifies the chair of the public body that such member's principal residence is more than 60 miles from the meeting location identified in the required notice for such meeting.

If participation by a member through electronic communication means is approved pursuant to this subsection, the public body holding the meeting shall record in its minutes the remote location from which the member participated; however, the remote location need not be open to the public.

If a member's participation from a remote location is disapproved because such participation would violate the policy adopted pursuant to subsection C, such disapproval shall be recorded in the minutes with specificity.
C. Participation by a member of a public body in a meeting through electronic communication means pursuant to subdivisions A 1 and 2 and subsection B shall be authorized only if the following conditions are met:

1. The public body has adopted a written policy allowing for and governing participation of its members by electronic communication means, including an approval process for such participation, subject to the express limitations imposed by this section. Once adopted, the policy shall be applied strictly and uniformly, without exception, to the entire membership and without regard to the identity of the member requesting remote participation or the matters that will be considered or voted on at the meeting;

2. A quorum of the public body is physically assembled at one primary or central meeting location; and

3. The public body makes arrangements for the voice of the remote participant to be heard by all persons at the primary or central meeting location.

D. The following provisions apply to state public bodies:

1. Except as provided in subsection D of § 2.2-3707.01, state public bodies may also conduct any meeting wherein the public business is discussed or transacted through electronic communication means, provided that (i) a quorum of the public body is physically assembled at one primary or central meeting location, (ii) notice of the meeting has been given in accordance with subdivision 2, and (iii) members of the public are provided a substantially equivalent electronic communication means through which to witness the meeting. For the purposes of this subsection, “witness” means observe or listen.

If a state public body holds a meeting through electronic communication means pursuant to this subsection, it shall also hold at least one meeting annually where members in attendance at the meeting are physically assembled at one location and where no members participate by electronic communication means.

2. Notice of any regular meeting held pursuant to this subsection shall be provided at least three working days in advance of the date scheduled for the meeting. Notice, reasonable under the circumstance, of special, emergency, or continued meetings held pursuant to this section shall be given contemporaneously with the notice provided to members of the public body conducting the meeting. For
the purposes of this subsection, "continued meeting" means a meeting that is continued to address an emergency or to conclude the agenda of a meeting for which proper notice was given.

The notice shall include the date, time, place, and purpose for the meeting; shall identify the primary or central meeting location and any remote locations that are open to the public pursuant to subdivision 4; shall include notice as to the electronic communication means by which members of the public may witness the meeting; and shall include a telephone number that may be used to notify the primary or central meeting location of any interruption in the telephonic or video broadcast of the meeting. Any interruption in the telephonic or video broadcast of the meeting shall result in the suspension of action at the meeting until repairs are made and public access is restored.

3. A copy of the proposed agenda and agenda packets and, unless exempt, all materials that will be distributed to members of a public body for a meeting shall be made available for public inspection at the same time such documents are furnished to the members of the public body conducting the meeting.

4. Public access to the remote locations from which additional members of the public body participate through electronic communication means shall be encouraged but not required. However, if three or more members are gathered at the same remote location, then such remote location shall be open to the public.

5. If access to remote locations is afforded, (i) all persons attending the meeting at any of the remote locations shall be afforded the same opportunity to address the public body as persons attending at the primary or central location and (ii) a copy of the proposed agenda and agenda packets and, unless exempt, all materials that will be distributed to members of the public body for the meeting shall be made available for inspection by members of the public attending the meeting at any of the remote locations at the time of the meeting.

6. The public body shall make available to the public at any meeting conducted in accordance with this subsection a public comment form prepared by the Virginia Freedom of Information Advisory Council in accordance with § 30-179.

7. Minutes of all meetings held by electronic communication means shall be recorded as required by § 2.2-3707. Votes taken during any meeting conducted through electronic communication means shall
be recorded by name in roll call fashion and included in the minutes. For emergency meetings held by electronic communication means, the nature of the emergency shall be stated in the minutes.

8. Any authorized state public body that meets by electronic communication means pursuant to this subsection shall make a written report of the following to the Virginia Freedom of Information Advisory Council by December 15 of each year:

a. The total number of meetings held that year in which there was participation through electronic communication means;

b. The dates and purposes of each such meeting;

c. A copy of the agenda for each such meeting;

d. The primary or central meeting location of each such meeting;

e. The types of electronic communication means by which each meeting was held;

f. If possible, the number of members of the public who witnessed each meeting through electronic communication means;

g. The identity of the members of the public body recorded as present at each meeting, and whether each member was present at the primary or central meeting location or participated through electronic communication means;

h. The identity of any members of the public body who were recorded as absent at each meeting and any members who were recorded as absent at a meeting but who monitored the meeting through electronic communication means;

i. If members of the public were granted access to a remote location from which a member participated in a meeting through electronic communication means, the number of members of the public at each such remote location;

j. A summary of any public comment received about the process of conducting a meeting through electronic communication means; and

k. A written summary of the public body’s experience conducting meetings through electronic communication means, including its logistical and technical experience.
E. Nothing in this section shall be construed to prohibit the use of interactive audio or video means to expand public participation.

§ 2.2-3708.3. Meetings held through electronic communication means.

A. Public bodies are encouraged to use hybrid public meetings to provide public access in person and through electronic communications means, to use interactive audio or video to expand observation of meetings, and to provide avenues for public comment at public meetings when public comment is customarily received, which may include public comments made in person, by electronic communication means, or both.

B. Individual members of a public body may use remote participation instead of attending a public meeting in person if, in advance of the public meeting, the public body has adopted a policy as described in subsection E and the member notifies the public body chair that:

1. The member has a temporary or permanent disability or other medical condition that prevents the member’s physical attendance;

2. A medical condition of a member of the member’s family requires the member to provide care that prevents the member’s physical attendance;

3. The member’s principal residence is more than 60 miles from the meeting location identified in the required notice for such meeting; or

4. The member is unable to attend the meeting due to a personal matter and identifies with specificity the nature of the personal matter. However, the member may not use remote participation due to personal matters more than two meetings per calendar year or 25 percent of the meetings held per calendar year rounded up to the next whole number, whichever is greater.

If participation by a member through electronic communication means is approved pursuant to this subsection, the public body holding the meeting shall record in its minutes the remote location from which the member participated; however, the remote location need not be open to the public and may be identified in the minutes by a general description. If participation is approved pursuant to subdivision 1 or 2, the public body shall also include in its minutes the fact that the member participated through electronic communication means due to a (i) temporary or permanent disability or other medical condition that
prevented the member's physical attendance or (ii) family member's medical condition that required the member to provide care for such family member, thereby preventing the member's physical attendance. If participation is approved pursuant to subdivision 3, the public body shall also include in its minutes the fact that the member participated through electronic communication means due to the distance between the member's principal residence and the meeting location. If participation is approved pursuant to subdivision 4, the public body shall also include in its minutes the specific nature of the personal matter cited by the member.

If a member's participation from a remote location pursuant to this subsection is disapproved because such participation would violate the policy adopted pursuant to subsection E, such disapproval shall be recorded in the minutes with specificity.

C. Any public body may hold all-virtual public meetings, provided that the public body follows the other requirements in this chapter for meetings, the public body has adopted a policy as described in subsection D, and:

1. The fact that the meeting will be an all-virtual public meeting is included in the required meeting notice;

2. Public access to the all-virtual public meeting is provided via electronic communications means;

3. The electronic communication means used allows the public to hear all members of the public body participating in the all-virtual public meeting and, when audio-visual technology is available, to see the members of the public body as well;

4. A phone number or other live contact information is provided to alert the public body if the audio or video transmission of the meeting provided by the public body fails, the public body monitors such designated means of communication during the meeting, and the public body takes a recess until public access is restored if the transmission fails for the public;

5. A copy of the proposed agenda and all agenda packets and, unless exempt, all materials furnished to members of a public body for a meeting are made available to the public in electronic format at the same time that such materials are provided to members of the public body;
6. The public is afforded the opportunity to comment through electronic means, including by way of written comments, at those public meetings when public comment is customarily received;

7. No more than two members of the public body are together in any one remote location unless that remote location is open to the public to physically access it;

8. If a closed session is held during an all-virtual public meeting, transmission of the meeting to the public resumes before the public body votes to certify the closed meeting as required by subsection D of § 2.2-3712;

9. The public body does not convene an all-virtual public meeting more than two times per calendar year, or 25 percent of the meetings held per calendar year rounded up to the next whole number, whichever is greater; and

10. Minutes of all-virtual public meetings held by electronic communication means are taken as required by § 2.2-3707 and include the fact that the meeting was held by electronic communication means and the type of electronic communication means by which the meeting was held. If a member's participation from a remote location pursuant to this subsection is disapproved because such participation would violate the policy adopted pursuant to subsection D, such disapproval shall be recorded in the minutes with specificity.

D. Before a public body uses all-virtual public meetings as described in subsection C or allows members to use remote participation as described in subsection B, the public body must first adopt a policy, by recorded vote at a public meeting, that shall be applied strictly and uniformly, without exception, to the entire membership and without regard to the identity of the member requesting remote participation or the matters that will be considered or voted on at the meeting. The policy shall:

1. Describe the circumstances under which remote participation will be allowed and the process the public body will use for making requests to use remote participation, approving or denying such requests, and creating a record of such requests; and

2. Fix the number of times remote participation for personal matters or all-virtual public meetings can be used per calendar year, not to exceed the limitations set forth in subdivisions B 4 and C 9.
Any public body that creates a committee, subcommittee, or other entity however designated of the public body to perform delegated functions of the public body or to advise the public body may also adopt a policy on behalf of its committee, subcommittee, or other entity that shall apply to the committee, subcommittee, or other entity's conduct of hybrid and all-virtual public meetings.

§ 2.2-3714. Violations and penalties.

A. In a proceeding commenced against any officer, employee, or member of a public body under § 2.2-3713 for a violation of § 2.2-3704, 2.2-3705.1 through 2.2-3705.7, 2.2-3706, 2.2-3706.1, 2.2-3707, 2.2-3708.2, 2.2-3708.3, 2.2-3710, 2.2-3711, or 2.2-3712, the court, if it finds that a violation was willfully and knowingly made, shall impose upon such officer, employee, or member in his individual capacity, whether a writ of mandamus or injunctive relief is awarded or not, a civil penalty of not less than $500 nor more than $2,000, which amount shall be paid into the Literary Fund. For a second or subsequent violation, such civil penalty shall be not less than $2,000 nor more than $5,000.

B. In addition to any penalties imposed pursuant to subsection A, if the court finds that any officer, employee, or member of a public body failed to provide public records to a requester in accordance with the provisions of this chapter because such officer, employee, or member altered or destroyed the requested public records with the intent to avoid the provisions of this chapter with respect to such request prior to the expiration of the applicable record retention period set by the retention regulations promulgated pursuant to the Virginia Public Records Act (§ 42.1-76 et seq.) by the State Library Board, the court may impose upon such officer, employee, or member in his individual capacity, whether or not a writ of mandamus or injunctive relief is awarded, a civil penalty of up to $100 per record altered or destroyed, which amount shall be paid into the Literary Fund.

C. In addition to any penalties imposed pursuant to subsections A and B, if the court finds that a public body voted to certify a closed meeting in accordance with subsection D of § 2.2-3712 and such certification was not in accordance with the requirements of clause (i) or (ii) of subsection D of § 2.2-3712, the court may impose on the public body, whether or not a writ of mandamus or injunctive relief is awarded, a civil penalty of up to $1,000, which amount shall be paid into the Literary Fund. In determining whether a civil penalty is appropriate, the court shall consider mitigating factors, including reliance of
members of the public body on (i) opinions of the Attorney General, (ii) court cases substantially supporting the rationale of the public body, and (iii) published opinions of the Freedom of Information Advisory Council.

#